

## The Numbers in Cuyahoga

November 11, 2004 (updated)

By Tim Lohrentz

Cell: 415-250-7879; Work: 510-251-2600

These are some of the statistical anomalies that I discovered when looking at Cuyahoga County votes by precinct. These numbers are from a spreadsheet created from the data on the County's website: <http://boe.cuyahogacounty.us/BOE/results/>. Taken together these abnormalities could total 3000 or 4000 votes and there are dozens of other precincts in Cuyahoga with similar anomalies on a smaller scale. And this is just one of Ohio's counties. Resolving some of the anomalies will give Kerry more votes while resolving others could favor Bush or Kerry. Precinct-level data for other counties either has not been released or has not yet been analyzed. Also, we do not know how many provisional ballots were handed out at each precinct.

1. Eight precincts in Cuyahoga had turnouts under 25 percent. This is hard to believe. They total 5821 registered voters and only 997 votes cast. They are all majority Kerry precincts. Note: The reported number of registered voters in Cleveland Precinct 13D may be wrong, as it is very large: 1,954.

**Table 1: Low Voter Turnout**

| Precinct # | Precinct Name    | 2004 Reg. Voters | Ballots Cast | Turnout | %Kerry |
|------------|------------------|------------------|--------------|---------|--------|
| 1231       | BROOK PARK 3-A   | 4                | 0            | 0.0%    |        |
| 2003       | CLEVELAND 6C     | 662              | 47           | 7.1%    | 97.8%  |
| 2704       | CLEVELAND 13D    | 1954             | 255          | 13.1%   | 82.5%  |
| 2706       | CLEVELAND 13F    | 847              | 166          | 19.6%   | 96.9%  |
| 7415       | UNIVERSITY HTS O | 831              | 173          | 20.8%   | 56.1%  |
| 2715       | CLEVELAND 13O    | 238              | 50           | 21.0%   | 89.8%  |
| 2002       | CLEVELAND 6B     | 399              | 87           | 21.8%   | 95.3%  |
| 2412       | CLEVELAND 10L    | 886              | 219          | 24.7%   | 96.7%  |

2. In 18 Cuyahoga precincts Badnarik and Peroutka together received over 6 percent of the vote, yet countywide they received 0.5 percent combined. These candidates may have had isolated pockets of strong support, but it is suspicious. Badnarik and Peroutka received 909 votes in these 18 precincts. If they had received 1 percent (above average) they would have received 57 votes, a difference of 852 votes.

**Table 2: Unusually High Percentage of Votes for Badnarik or Peroutka**

| Precinct # | Precinct Name      | Badnarik | Bush | Kerry | Peroutka | Bush% | Kerry% | Badnarik + Peroutka |
|------------|--------------------|----------|------|-------|----------|-------|--------|---------------------|
| 2804       | CLEVELAND 14D      | 1        | 0    | 1     | 0        | 0%    | 50%    | 50%                 |
| 1806       | CLEVELAND 4F       | 0        | 21   | 290   | 215      | 4%    | 55%    | 41%                 |
| 1814       | CLEVELAND 4N       | 163      | 11   | 318   | 7        | 2%    | 64%    | 34%                 |
| 3943       | EUCLID 3-C         | 1        | 97   | 205   | 88       | 25%   | 52%    | 23%                 |
| 2207       | CLEVELAND 8G       | 51       | 19   | 225   | 1        | 6%    | 76%    | 18%                 |
| 3941       | EUCLID 3-A         | 8        | 21   | 37    | 4        | 30%   | 53%    | 17%                 |
| 2717       | CLEVELAND 13Q      | 9        | 32   | 56    | 8        | 30%   | 53%    | 16%                 |
| 1902       | CLEVELAND 5B       | 0        | 12   | 74    | 16       | 12%   | 73%    | 16%                 |
| 1709       | CLEVELAND 3I       | 1        | 13   | 464   | 70       | 2%    | 85%    | 13%                 |
| 2724       | CLEVELAND 13X      | 1        | 8    | 312   | 37       | 2%    | 87%    | 11%                 |
| 2209       | CLEVELAND 8I       | 0        | 8    | 245   | 27       | 3%    | 88%    | 10%                 |
| 1916       | CLEVELAND 5P       | 0        | 8    | 21    | 3        | 25%   | 66%    | 9%                  |
| 5931       | NORTH ROYALTON 3-A | 4        | 240  | 187   | 37       | 51%   | 40%    | 9%                  |
| 3846       | EAST CLEVELAND 4-F | 34       | 11   | 386   | 3        | 3%    | 89%    | 9%                  |
| 1702       | CLEVELAND 3B       | 41       | 17   | 456   | 1        | 3%    | 89%    | 8%                  |
| 6304       | ORANGE D           | 12       | 86   | 180   | 9        | 30%   | 63%    | 7%                  |
| 2908       | CLEVELAND 15H      | 15       | 80   | 206   | 7        | 26%   | 67%    | 7%                  |
| 2513       | CLEVELAND 11M      | 30       | 45   | 428   | 5        | 9%    | 84%    | 7%                  |

3. In 20 Cuyahoga precincts and one absentee ballot region, more than 6 percent of ballots cast had no tally in the Presidential race. Some of these may be protest votes, but it is likely that most are due to spoilage (human or machine error). Most of these precincts already had low voter turnout before considering the "missing" Presidential votes. The statewide average for "missing" Presidential votes was 1.7% and the Cuyahoga average was 1.9%. The "missing" Presidential votes in these 21 jurisdictions total 961 ballots. Assuming that only 3 percent of ballots cast were legitimately "spoiled" in these areas (already a high amount), only 299 ballots would have "missing" Presidential votes, a difference of 662 ballots. In total in Cuyahoga, there were 12,953 ballots cast with no Presidential tally, while state-wide the total is 92,672. See a summary I wrote regarding the Ohio spoiled ballots: <http://newswire.indymedia.org/en/newswire/2004/11/813905.shtml> and a summary of the 14 priority counties in Ohio with statistical anomalies: <http://cleveland.indymedia.org/news/2004/11/13256.php>.

**Table 3: High Percentage of Ballots Missing the Presidential Vote Tally**

| Precinct # | Precinct Name       | 2004 Reg. Voters | Ballots Cast | Votes PRES | Bush% | Kerry% | No Pres Vote | % No Pres Vote |
|------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------|------------|-------|--------|--------------|----------------|
| 6450       | PARMA 5-E           | 972              | 917          | 654        | 52%   | 47%    | 263          | 29%            |
| 2013       | CLEVELAND 6M        | 938              | 438          | 369        | 2%    | 97%    | 69           | 16%            |
| 2209       | CLEVELAND 8I        | 622              | 318          | 280        | 3%    | 88%    | 38           | 12%            |
| 3301       | CLEVELAND 19A       | 19               | 9            | 8          | 0%    | 100%   | 1            | 11%            |
| 0210       | BEACHWOOD J         | 810              | 277          | 247        | 19%   | 81%    | 30           | 11%            |
| 2708       | CLEVELAND 13H       | 300              | 95           | 85         | 12%   | 84%    | 10           | 11%            |
| 3943       | EUCLID 3-C          | 746              | 436          | 391        | 25%   | 52%    | 45           | 10%            |
| 7320       | STRONGSVILLE 1-J    | 48               | 31           | 28         | 46%   | 54%    | 3            | 10%            |
| 1906       | CLEVELAND 5F        | 924              | 457          | 415        | 1%    | 99%    | 42           | 9%             |
| 2010       | CLEVELAND 6J        | 696              | 303          | 277        | 3%    | 97%    | 26           | 9%             |
| 1504       | CLEVELAND 1D        | 778              | 414          | 381        | 3%    | 97%    | 33           | 8%             |
| 2004       | CLEVELAND 6D        | 503              | 143          | 132        | 4%    | 96%    | 11           | 8%             |
| 2909       | CLEVELAND 15I       | 611              | 292          | 270        | 31%   | 67%    | 22           | 8%             |
| 5931       | NORTH ROYALTON 3-A  | 805              | 502          | 468        | 51%   | 40%    | 34           | 7%             |
| 3964       | EUCLID 4-D          | 1282             | 563          | 525        | 6%    | 94%    | 38           | 7%             |
| 2724       | CLEVELAND 13X       | 823              | 383          | 358        | 2%    | 87%    | 25           | 7%             |
| 2518       | CLEVELAND 11R       | 632              | 360          | 337        | 13%   | 87%    | 23           | 6%             |
| 7915       | ABSENTEE - 11-11-21 |                  | 2633         | 2469       | 13%   | 86%    | 164          | 6%             |
| 2313       | CLEVELAND 9M        | 1004             | 476          | 447        | 3%    | 97%    | 29           | 6%             |
| 2101       | CLEVELAND 7A        | 848              | 498          | 468        | 4%    | 96%    | 30           | 6%             |
| 2318       | CLEVELAND 9R        | 775              | 420          | 395        | 3%    | 97%    | 25           | 6%             |

4. Sen. George Voinovich, a Republican, successfully ran for re-election in Ohio. He easily defeated State Sen. Eric Fingerhut and in Cuyahoga County he garnered 52.5 percent of the vote, 19.4 percent more than Bush received in the Presidential race in Cuyahoga. Yet in five precincts Voinovich received a lower percentage of votes in his race than Bush received in the Presidential race. In 12 other precincts Bush's vote percentage was within 5 percent of Voinovich. This is quite suspicious. Bush received a total of 1,983 votes in these precincts compared to 1,984 votes for Voinovich in his race. If Bush had received 10 percent less of the votes in these precincts compared to Voinovich (still closer than normal), Bush would have received a total of 1485 votes, a difference of 498. It is especially strange that 11 of these 17 precincts are in the town of Beachwood and two others are in University Heights. Both of these towns were rather contentious - close to 50-50 between Bush and Kerry.

**Table 4: Bush Votes Unusually Close to Incumbent Republican Senator Voinovich's Votes**

| Precinct # | Precinct Name    | Bush | Kerry | Bush% | Kerry% | SEN Race<br>Voinovich | % Voinovich<br>Voinovich | % Voinovich -<br>Bush (pct) |
|------------|------------------|------|-------|-------|--------|-----------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|
| 0202       | BEACHWOOD B      | 194  | 211   | 48%   | 52%    | 166                   | 42%                      | -6%                         |
| 7411       | UNIVERSITY HTS K | 191  | 195   | 49%   | 50%    | 167                   | 45%                      | -5%                         |
| 0207       | BEACHWOOD G      | 151  | 193   | 44%   | 56%    | 132                   | 39%                      | -4%                         |
| 0214       | BEACHWOOD N      | 117  | 192   | 38%   | 62%    | 100                   | 33%                      | -4%                         |
| 6724       | RICHMOND HTS 2-D | 3    | 5     | 38%   | 63%    | 2                     | 33%                      | -4%                         |
| 2804       | CLEVELAND 14D    | 0    | 1     | 0%    | 50%    | 0                     | 0%                       | 0%                          |
| 0206       | BEACHWOOD F      | 117  | 256   | 31%   | 69%    | 115                   | 32%                      | 0%                          |
| 7412       | UNIVERSITY HTS L | 165  | 229   | 42%   | 58%    | 166                   | 43%                      | 1%                          |
| 0208       | BEACHWOOD H      | 130  | 305   | 30%   | 70%    | 135                   | 31%                      | 2%                          |
| 0211       | BEACHWOOD K      | 108  | 303   | 26%   | 74%    | 116                   | 29%                      | 2%                          |
| 0210       | BEACHWOOD J      | 47   | 200   | 19%   | 81%    | 52                    | 21%                      | 2%                          |
| 0215       | BEACHWOOD O      | 118  | 373   | 24%   | 76%    | 130                   | 27%                      | 3%                          |
| 0212       | BEACHWOOD L      | 77   | 164   | 32%   | 67%    | 83                    | 35%                      | 3%                          |
| 0209       | BEACHWOOD I      | 82   | 248   | 25%   | 75%    | 94                    | 29%                      | 4%                          |
| 5502       | MORELAND HILLS B | 158  | 160   | 50%   | 50%    | 166                   | 54%                      | 5%                          |
| 4601       | HUNTING VALLEY A | 215  | 82    | 72%   | 27%    | 228                   | 77%                      | 5%                          |
| 0201       | BEACHWOOD A      | 110  | 299   | 27%   | 73%    | 132                   | 32%                      | 5%                          |

5. In eight precincts there were more votes cast in the Senate race than were cast in the Presidential race. While this is certainly possible, generally more votes are made in the Presidential race than the Senatorial race. County-wide there were 34,158 more votes cast in the Presidential race than the Senate race (5% more). In one Parma precinct, there were 196 more votes cast in the Senatorial race than the Presidential race, although given the 94% turnout rate, it is more likely that the Senate race numbers are suspicious here.

**Table 5: More Votes Cast in the Senate Race than the Presidential Race**

| Precinct # | Precinct Name      | Ballots<br>Cast | Turnout | Votes<br>PRES | Bush% | Kerry% | Votes<br>Senate | Vote Diff.<br>Sen > Pres | % Sen ><br>Pres |
|------------|--------------------|-----------------|---------|---------------|-------|--------|-----------------|--------------------------|-----------------|
| 6450       | PARMA 5-E          | 917             | 94%     | 654           | 52%   | 47%    | 850             | 196                      | 30%             |
| 7320       | STRONGSVILLE 1-J   | 31              | 65%     | 28            | 46%   | 54%    | 30              | 2                        | 7%              |
| 3943       | EUCLID 3-C         | 436             | 58%     | 391           | 25%   | 52%    | 407             | 16                       | 4%              |
| 5931       | NORTH ROYALTON 3-A | 502             | 62%     | 468           | 51%   | 40%    | 476             | 8                        | 2%              |
| 7163       | OLON 6-C           | 581             | 71%     | 561           | 41%   | 57%    | 565             | 4                        | 1%              |
| 6454       | PARMA 5-I          | 307             | 64%     | 297           | 51%   | 48%    | 299             | 2                        | 1%              |
| 0145       | BAY VILLAGE 4-E    | 308             | 60%     | 304           | 63%   | 37%    | 305             | 1                        | 0%              |
| 2908       | CLEVELAND 15H      | 320             | 52%     | 308           | 26%   | 67%    | 309             | 1                        | 0%              |

## Conclusion

Dozens of precincts in Cuyahoga County have serious statistical anomalies and over 100 others have similar anomalies on a smaller scale. These are the ten precincts with the most serious anomalies:

1. Cleveland 6C Only 7 percent voter turnout (47 ballots of 662 registered)
2. Euclid 3C 88 votes for Peroutka; 45 ballots with no Presidential vote recorded; 16 more votes cast in the Senate race than the Pres. race
3. North Royalton 3A 37 votes for Peroutka; 34 ballots with no Presidential vote recorded; 8 more votes cast in the Senate race than the Pres. race
4. Beachwood J 30 ballots with no Presidential vote recorded; Bush had only 5 votes less than "popular" Republican Sen. Voinovich had in his race.
5. Beachwood B Bush received 28 more votes in his race than Voinovich received in his race (overall Voinovich received 19% more of the vote than Bush)
- 6.TIE Beachwood G & N Bush received 19 and 17 more votes, respectively, in his race than Voinovich received in his race
7. Cleveland 4F 215 votes for Peroutka
8. University Heights K Bush received 24 more votes in his race than Voinovich received in his race
9. Cleveland 4N 163 votes for Badnarik
10. Cleveland 3I 70 votes for Peroutka

This is where I would start any investigation or recount.

Tim Lohrentz  
Independent Mathematician

Board Member  
US-EI Salvador Sister Cities  
[www.us-elsalvador-sisters.org](http://www.us-elsalvador-sisters.org)

Tim Lohrentz  
Senior Program Specialist  
National Economic Development & Law Center  
2201 Broadway, Suite 815  
Oakland, CA 94612  
tel: 510-251-2600 x 121  
[www.nedlc.org](http://www.nedlc.org)